

## **Biology, Sociology, Political Science, English: Writing Across the Curriculum at Quinnipiac University**

---

The writing-across-the-curriculum program at Quinnipiac University is designed to foster strong writing in every field by recognizing the dual function of writing in education. Writing is not simply a way of communicating what one has learned; it is also a way of learning and thinking. Based on this broad approach to encouraging good writing across the curriculum, Quinnipiac University's Writing-Across-The-Curriculum program has encouraged faculty to use writing as a spur to critical thinking (using writing to learn assignments, or WTLs) and on the linkages between this writing to learn material and the formal writing that students do in their classes to demonstrate mastery of the subject material (what we call writing in the disciplines, or WID). The two examples are linked integrally: clear thinking yields better writing, and QU's writing across the curriculum (WAC) is shaped by faculty efforts to use WTL assignments to increase student understanding of subject material in classes outside of English, and then linking the products of those assignments to formal written assignments in which students demonstrate their mastery of the subject material and their understanding of the written conventions of their majors. Some of the more familiar ways of writing-to-learn are annotating as one reads, keeping a journal, formulating questions, writing a précis, or analyzing an argument. For both novice and expert, writing can be a way of playing around with ideas and relationships, manipulating the known facts or familiar interpretations to create a fresh angle of vision—a way of “doodling” or dreaming or meditating with words. Most writing to learn assignments present students with an opportunity to reshape what they are studying into knowledge, an understanding of the material that allows them to use what they've learned, not merely repeat it on exams and papers. This construction of knowledge is central to the idea of WAC at Quinnipiac University, since the best writing in any field reflects the ability of the writer to use what s/he has learned in contexts and applications outside the original context in which it was first introduced. The following examples of WAC reflect both ends of this writing/thinking continuum: the writing to learn assignments in which students practice and demonstrate their critical thinking skills, and formal written assignments from a number of disciplines, in which students demonstrate their mastery of the material and their ability to report that mastery in the written forms of their majors.

Professor Dennis Richardson invites his students to “play around” with the science learned in his Biology 106 class by writing poems. Poems of this kind are not designed simply to express the writer's feelings about science; they use poetic form to explore concepts and scientific relationships in a whimsical way that we can feel or take some aesthetic pleasure in as well as know. The ability to speak about a subject in a form different from the expected one is a form of argument: the writer

*Quinnipiac University Casebook*

needs to understand the material well enough to select “telling” details that would be appropriate for the poetic form. The following are good examples of this:

The Scales of Life  
by Jode-Lee McCarthy

Organism.  
Solitary, alone,  
Complex yet minute.  
Singular.

Population.  
Coexisting, cohesive,  
A singular species.  
United.

Community.  
Competing, adjoining,  
All species united.  
Integrated.

Ecosystem.  
Biotic/abiotic  
Nature integrated.  
Collected.

Ecosystem.  
Interactive, connected.  
Each system collected.  
Complete.

A Poem about Evolution  
by Michelle Cuomo

*Homo erectus*  
*Homo erectus*  
Why have you left us?  
They say you were a dead-end  
a mistake that evolution could not mend.

life

from bacteria to protista  
we feed  
we reproduce

from fungi to plants  
we feed  
we reproduce

from invertebrates to vertebrates  
we feed  
we reproduce

life begins, life thrives, life ends  
everything in between will either minimize or maximize, life depends  
life is ours

by Tony Ciaramella

---

**Discussion Question**

What do you learn about science from reading these poems? Can you identify the knowledge of science necessary to write each poem?

---

If you assume that the form of the poems, the actual framing of the words in the space of the page, is not accidental but intentional, what conclusions can you draw about the choices that each poet made to produce these poems?

Sentences are arranged by the syntactical rules governing the construction of proper English communication: subject followed by verb followed by object or some acceptable variation thereof. How are these poems arranged? What “system” can you see in the individual poems that helps to organize them into a form that you automatically recognize as “poem?”

---

## **Sociology 381: Writing in the Disciplines**

---

Where writing across the curriculum encourages writing to learn, emphasis on writing in the disciplines supports students in learning the specific forms, analytical style, and specialist vocabulary that professionals use to communicate their research results. The work students do for the literature review, in Professor Suzanne Hudd’s Sociology 381 course, is a good example of professional writing of this kind.

Sociology 381 is a required course for Sociology majors. A main goal of the course is to prepare students to read and analyze sociological literature in preparation for their senior thesis. Each semester, the class completes an evaluation of a program on or near campus. The main writing assignment for the course requires the students to read ten articles related to the program area under study in order to inform the evaluation students complete as a class. Students must then prepare a ten-page paper that summarizes and analyzes the literature. The students’ goal in doing the assignment is two-fold: to summarize what other researchers have found on the topic and to suggest areas for future research that will facilitate and enrich our program evaluation.

In the spring of 2004, the freshman writing program commissioned Professor Hudd’s Sociology 381 class to do a study of the use of technology in freshman writing classes. Jennifer Hannon’s literature review on plagiarism, below, prepared her to offer input on the issue of plagiarism for the class’s larger project.

---

Jennifer Hannon  
Lit. Review

05 April 2004  
Soc. 381

Literature Review: Plagiarism

Plagiarism can be a difficult topic to understand and fully comprehend, which may explain why it happens so frequently. In 1998, Who's Who Among High School Students administered a survey to 3,123 college-bound seniors and found that 80 percent admitted to cheating, 83 percent said that cheating was common at their school, and more than half, 53 percent, did not think that cheating was a "big deal" (Cole and Kiss, 2000). There are many perspectives on the causes of plagiarism. Some believe that it is due to a lack of proper teaching of the topic (Wilhoit, 1994), while others blame the advancement of technology and the availability of the internet as the cause (Owen, 2001). Many teachers and other professionals have developed suggestions and preventative measures to combat plagiarism. However, the main goal for teachers and faculty is to not catch and punish the perpetrator, but to educate the student on his mistake and find out why it happened (Owen, 2001).

The goal of this literature review is to familiarize the reader on the subject of plagiarism. Student and faculty perspectives, as well as reasons why students plagiarize, have been researched and discussed. After discussing possible reasons why students plagiarize, suggestions and programs are

### *Quinnipiac University Casebook*

offered to help alleviate the problem. The advancement of technology has been beneficial and detrimental to student and faculty views and attitudes toward plagiarism.

#### A Comparison of Perspectives

Some argue students' and faculty views of plagiarism are very different due to their opposite positions in the school hierarchy, but research shows that it is not completely true. Livosky and Tauber (1994) performed a study using 446 students and 97 faculty members and examined their views of potential cheating during in-class exams. Of the 446 total students involved, 391 attended a public state university and 55 attended a private university. All the faculty members were from the public state university. The survey respondents were asked to respond with "Yes" or "No" to express their opinion of whether or not the situation presented was an example of cheating. In addition, each person was also asked to categorize the cheating into one of three general categories: Intent, Intent plus Commission, and Commission without Intent. Each respondent also ranked the severity of the cheating on a scale of 1 (not an example of cheating) to 5 (serious example of cheating). The results of this study suggest that faculty and students tend to define cheating in the same ways. When the private university students were included, there was a disagreement between the students and faculty on only one situation. However, it was noted that

public and private university students differed in three situations. In these instances the private university students were stricter than the public university students. The general findings of this study were that students and faculty agree on examples of cheating, which means that their perspectives on cheating are not as different as some may believe.

Mathews (1999) assessed the differences between student and faculty attitudes toward academic dishonesty in schools with an honor system. He surveyed 494 students and 46 faculty members by giving them a Personal Opinion Blank that contained thirty-six situations describing academic dishonesty. After reading each description, the respondent had to decide if the person in the situation acted in a justified, unjustified, or doubtful manner. The results showed that the faculty did not justify actions as often as students did and the responses among the faculty varied for all situations except one. The study also found that the juniors and seniors were less strict in their views of academic dishonesty, in comparison to the freshman and sophomores. It was also noted that students were more tolerant of academic dishonesty in preparing assignments than during exams. The percentage of "unjustified" responses on assignments was 62%, but the same students marked exam situations "unjustified" 77% of the time. The faculty members did not justify either situation and were equally strict on

### *Quinnipiac University Casebook*

assignment and exam situations. The main findings of this study suggest that honor systems do have an affect on students' views of academically dishonest acts the majority of the time. The faculty was in agreement with the students' views in most of the situations presented, but in others there were major disagreements.

It seems that faculty and students view plagiarism and other academic dishonest situations in similar ways. In some instances, however, students' views on cheating are more lenient than faculty and situations are justified more by students. Overall though, students and faculty have the same opinions and beliefs about plagiarism, which is an important step toward combating plagiarism.

#### Combating Plagiarism

Plagiarism is a common topic of discussion in middle school and high school, but by then it is too late and ineffective because students are already doing it. Saunders' (1985) research suggests that the definition of plagiarism and how to avoid it must be taught at young ages. When students are introduced to writing in elementary school, they should also be exposed to plagiarism. In addition, he notes three ways to control plagiarism: provide positive feedback on student's writing, model appropriate ways to get writing ideas, and explicitly explain the importance of not using other people's ideas as your own.

When discussing plagiarism it is important to determine why students plagiarize. Wilhoit (1994) points out that part of teaching students how to avoid plagiarism and other academically dishonest acts is to understand their reasoning. He believes that students can be discouraged from plagiarizing if they fully understand the consequences of their actions and learn time management and writing skills. Incorrect instruction from teachers on how to properly cite and correctly write papers is another reason students plagiarize. Wilhoit argues that without sufficient repetition and reinforcement of proper instructions for writing, students frequently misunderstand the definition of plagiarism. Thus, they repeatedly turn in plagiarized papers because they have not learned or understood how to avoid it or have been taught to write incorrectly. Another common reason that students plagiarize is due to the pressures that they face from the school, family, and peers. Recognizing and understanding the student's perspective will allow the teacher to address the problem and properly deal with it.

Cole and Kiss (2000) believe that student cheating may decline if there are policies and practices that make academic integrity an integral and normal aspect of campus life. They offer two general approaches that can be implemented in order to decrease cheating. The first is based on the distrust of students and assumes they will try to cheat and attempts at

*Winnipeg University Casebook*

ways to make it more difficult for them to do so. To accomplish this goal, they suggest that there be more attentive proctors during exams, increase the distance between students during exams, create many versions of tests, no bags allowed in the classroom, and ID's checked at the door.

These ideas and practices have become obsolete due to advancements in technology. Now, some test centers create individualized tests for students and have surveillance cameras. There have also been websites created, such as [plagiarism.org](http://plagiarism.org), that allow faculty to check the credibility of student's papers, if they feel the need to do so.

Cole and Kiss (2000) argue that an alternative and better approach is for educators to take on the responsibility of teaching students that they should not cheat and to teach the students why academic integrity is important. Schools with honor codes provide evidence that this works because these schools have lower rates of cheating, even though they have unproctored exams and self-scheduled exams. Through their research, Cole and Kiss (2000) found that students are more likely to cheat when they believe that the assignment is not important and less likely to cheat if they enjoy what they are learning and respect and admire their teachers. This approach is centered on good teaching and learning, as well as ethical and intellectual development for students.

Wilhoit (1994) recognizes the complexity of plagiarism and feels that in order to succeed in helping students avoid it there must be patience, understanding, and a variety of options for teachers. He suggests distributing a printed statement to students with the definition of plagiarism and examples for them to review and revise, as well as the consequences of intentionally turning in a plagiarized paper. Teaching proper note-taking skills, reviewing the proper way to quote and cite materials, requiring multiple drafts of papers, and providing proofreading guidelines are also beneficial. He mentions that it is important for teachers to remember to react to a student's mistakes in a suitable manner. If teachers respond to unintentional plagiarism and less serious mistakes in a fair way, they can help the student understand and avoid the mistake in the future. Patience is also an important factor to remember. He feels that with time, a change in attitudes, and improved teaching strategies, plagiarism will decrease in classrooms.

Plagiarism is a very complex and difficult topic for students and teachers, but that does not mean there is nothing that can be done about it. As Saunders' (1985) research discussed, plagiarism should be taught and discussed early in education. If students understand what plagiarism is and how to avoid it that will likely decrease the chances of plagiarism occurring later in life. Unfortunately, many

### *Winnipeg University Casebook*

students are misinformed or incorrectly taught at a young age. For these students, it is important for teachers to be patient and understand their lack of knowledge and properly and accurately teach them about it. The only way students will become better writers and avoid plagiarism is to become educated on the topic, practice writing and learn from their mistakes.

#### The Role of Technology

In the past few years, technology has become an integral part of student learning. Students are encouraged to do research on the Internet and expand their knowledge through the convenience and availability of computers. However, Atkins and Nelson (2001) believe that the Internet is being abused by students. They found over 200 websites that contain papers students can purchase. If a student wishes to "beat the system", he or she may cut and paste sections of many papers to create a new one, but fail to properly cite the sources. They do not use quotation marks or acknowledge that the work is someone else's. It is also very easy for students to send papers to each other and turn them in for a different class or different teacher.

Dr. John Barrie and colleagues developed TurnItIn.com as a solution to the plagiarism problem caused by the Internet. This program is an internet scanner that highlights plagiarized material in student papers. The student's paper

is compared to Internet sites and other papers that have previously been uploaded to TurnItIn.com. It also searches commercial encyclopedias, book reviews, and the numerous paper mills. Barrie and his colleagues did not design for this program to punish students. Rather, they want the program to help students understand and maintain their ethics and academic integrity, as well as learn the appropriate skills to communicate effectively (Atkins, et.al., 2001).

Royce (2003) researched the strengths and weaknesses of TurnItIn.com. He found that TurnItIn.com investigates more than 10,000 papers a day and about 3,000 of them are plagiarized. His research suggests that TurnItIn.com is being used as a successful deterrent to cheating in a number of schools that subscribe to it. There are two strengths to this program: it has the ability to search the Internet faster and longer than a person would be able to and each paper that is submitted gets added to the ever-growing database of papers.

Despite the positive aspects of TurnItIn.com, there are some negative features as well. One downside to using a program like this is that teachers place too much emphasis on the credibility and accuracy of the program. If a paper is returned and found to be plagiarized, usually the teacher will automatically assume the student is guilty of plagiarism. However, TurnItIn.com has been proven as imperfect and the creators admit it has flaws. Some flaws exist in text and

*Quinnipiac University Casebook*

essay conversions to a foreign language and then back to English, plagiarism of graphs and diagrams, and in transformations and paraphrases (Royce, 2003). These areas where TurnItIn.com is unsuccessful allows students to con their teachers into thinking they understand the material when they actually might not. Copying or taking graphs and diagrams is a problem because that data is not the data that the student found through his or her own research, but what someone else found. Another major concern is that TurnItIn.com only searches until it finds one match and then it stops. It does not specify what the problem was, but simply that a match was made (Royce 2003). In instances such as these, there is a lack of evidence to prove that the student did cheat and he or she may be wrongly accused of plagiarism.

Certainly the role of technology has changed the way students and teachers approach writing and reading papers. Students may be deterred by plagiarism detection services, such as TurnItIn.com, or they may enjoy the concept of purchasing papers online. Teachers now have the ability to check papers for plagiarism without having to do it themselves, but must remember that these programs are not perfect. Though these programs may be used as a successful deterrent, it is still important for teachers to check out student's citations if they are provided.

### Conclusion

The eternal conflict between students and faculty members continues on with the contradictory evidence of each group's views on plagiarism and academic honesty situations. The results of this research suggests that in the majority of situations students and faculty are likely to agree on the definition of plagiarism, as well as examples of cheating or dishonest acts. However, there it was also found that there is still disagreement among the two groups in some cheating situations. In these instances the students are more likely to justify cheating than faculty members. In order to determine more conclusive results, more research needs to be done on the topic.

Many researchers have proposed varied approaches and suggestions to combat plagiarism. Each researcher believes that there are certain attributes that should be taught to students to achieve more academically honest students. Though these attributes vary from person to person, but many researchers, such as Wilhoit (1994) and Owens (2001), believe that finding out why students plagiarize is the most important thing that teachers must do. Another common belief is that plagiarism needs to be openly discussed in classrooms. This will provide an opportunity for students and teachers to openly discuss plagiarism and allow students to become aware and more understanding of the topic.

*Q*uinnipiac University Casebook

With advancements in technology, teachers are able to use computers in their classrooms, as well as to control the amount of plagiarized papers they receive. Some teachers feel that it is necessary to use plagiarism programs, such as TurnItIn.com, as a deterrent to student cheating (Royce, 2003). This has been proven as an effective deterrent, but it is still necessary for teachers to discuss plagiarism and teach the proper techniques to avoid plagiarizing papers (Owen, 2001).

Technology has also benefited students because they are granted twenty-four hour access to the Internet to do research or easily communicate with others. The temptation and ability to plagiarize has also increased with the presence of paper mills and access to other student's papers. Students today have the difficult job of avoiding paper mills and knowing that doing their own work is the right thing to do. Eventually, technology will become even more involved in our everyday lives and by then companies will have perfected plagiarism detection programs for teachers to use and students will be forced to be honest with themselves and the work they hand in.

---

References

Atkins, Thomas and Gene Nelson. 2001. "Plagiarism and the

- Internet: Turning the Tables." *English Journal*: 101-104.
- Cole, Sally and Elizabeth Kiss. 2000. "What Can We Do About Student Cheating?" *About Campus* 5 (2): 5-12.
- Livosky, Marilyn and Robert T. Tauber. 1994. "Views of Cheating Among College Students and Faculty." *Psychology in the Schools* 31: 72-79
- Mathews, C.O. 1999. "The Honor System." *Journal of Higher Education* 70 (5): 504-509
- Owen, Trevor. 2001. "Learning with Technology." *English Journal*. 90 (4): 101.
- Royce, John. 2003. "Got It All Wrapped Up?" *Teacher Librarian* 30 (4): 26-30.
- Saunders, Edward J. 1985. "Confronting Academic Dishonesty." *Journal of Social Work Education* 29 (2): 224-231
- Wilhoit, Stephen. 1994. "Helping Students Avoid Plagiarism." *College Teaching* 42 (4): 161-164

---

## Discussion Questions: Making Connections

---

1. Students in high school are often taught to avoid using words such as "seems" or "suggests," which are sometimes described as "wishy-washy." Locate several places where Hannon uses these words and explain why they are appropriately used to reflect the *ethos* of academic discourse. Why would university knowledge-makers deliberately write sentences that show incertitude or doubt while popular opinion is often expressed with the kind of conviction or certitude that leaves no doubt?
2. In what way is Hannon's discipline-specific summary different from popular or commonsense ideas of summary? How has she focused the summaries in her literature review?
3. Look back over the work students do in English 101 and 102, Biology 106, and Sociology 381. Describe the learning process for university readers and writers

that you see reflected there. What skills will you need to learn over the course of your four years at Quinnipiac?

---

Now compare the style and approach to the argument of the Sociology paper to the following paper from an English course on The Nature Essay from Spring 2005. This is a paper written by Ashley Balogh for an English 206 course taught by Professor Robert Smart. The assignment called for students to explore modern attitudes towards Nature in contrast to traditional and historical attitudes. The point of the essay was to argue for a “fifth paradigm” through which we might better understand humans’ relationship to Nature:

Ashley Balogh  
Professor Smart

English 206  
3-9-05

### **The Existential Paradigm**

In much of the nature readings from the past, we have seen the writers give nature purposefulness. New ideas introduced by Lewis Thomas, however, challenge most aspects covered by these paradigms. He introduced new perspectives on the short time that man has actually inhabited the earth, and proposed that death is much more instrumental in the life cycle than we usually think of it to be. In “The World’s Biggest Membrane,” he points out that existential time, beginning “when the earth came alive” and breathed oxygen, is much longer than humans have occupied the earth, especially since we have recorded history. Rather than turning towards religious deities, Thomas recognizes time and death as “higher powers.” He proposes that death is much less exceptional than we think it to be, and it affects all parts of the living world every second of the day. Although

the earth is responsible for bringing forth life, we do not realize that death is also contained within the earth. These ideas bring us to the point that not only is nature is not here for us, but just like us, it is a functioning part of the living entity of earth. The concepts presented by Thomas, as well as the similar thoughts of Virginia Woolf, Norman Maclean, and Richard Jeffries defy the four original paradigms and force us to create a new, fifth paradigm. The most appropriate name for this view would be the Existential Life Paradigm, and its main criteria include the ideas of time and death being higher powers that rule all living parts of a whole, breathing earth. The earth brings forth all life, and in inescapable death, all things become part of the earth once again, leaving little impression in the grand scheme of things.

In comparing human time and existential time, we can see that there is something much bigger than humans, and that lies in a deeper history than human history. It is important to remember that not only was there life on Earth long before humans, but humans also dwelled on the earth for some time without finding it necessary to record history or invent methods of time, which Thomas pointed out. We are really just a pinprick on the map of existential time. Norman Maclean also encounters the wrath of time, which we grasp in the loss he feels when reminiscing about those who have passed. To Norman, the river represents time. Norman goes to the Big Blackfoot River, where he and his brother Paul fly-fished with their father. When they were

boys, their father explained that they can read the hand of God underneath the rocks. He does not mean this literally, of course, but it tells the stories of times that have passed, and as an old man Norman revisits the place nostalgically: “Eventually all things merge into one and the river runs through it.” Norman is able to return to the river and his memories, because in his lifetime, the river has not much changed. This is further proof of the insignificance of our time on this Earth, especially because in the excerpt from the novel, he points out how it had changed over the passing of time. He writes, “From its headwaters to its mouth, it was manufactured by glaciers . . . . it was the biggest flood in the world for which there is geological evidence; it was so vast a geological event that the mind of man could only conceive of it but could not prove it until photographs could be taken from earth satellites” (458). Thomas also belittles the power of man when he praises the greatness of the atmosphere and points out exactly how it nurtures the earth, although we do not necessary realize it. He writes, “We should credit it for what it is: for sheer size and perfection of function, it is far and away the grandest product of collaboration in all of nature” (538).

We also encounter the idea that death, which goes hand in hand with time, is another “Higher Power.” Rather than nature or God being the highest power, death is the force that rules us all, and no living organism can escape it. Immortality does not exist. Inevitable death is more significant than any religion developed by humans.

Thomas points out that all life is a struggle against death, and we must to accept death as a necessity in order for the Earth to regenerate. He writes, “There are 3 billion of us on the earth, and all 3 billion of us must be dead, on a schedule, within this lifetime” (535). We see similar ideas in Virginia Woolf’s essay, “The Death of a Moth,” when she discusses the “power” of death, whose wrath can grip the smallest of creatures, or entire cities of people. She sits at her window watching a moth fight death, while centuries earlier, most of Europe was wiped out by the Bubonic Plague. She writes,

One could only watch the extraordinary efforts made by those tiny legs against an oncoming doom which could, had it chose, submerged an entire city, not merely a city, but masses of human beings; nothing, I knew, had any chance against death (345).

After the moth finally accepted defeat, Woolf noted, “O yes, he seemed to say, death is stronger than I am” (345). This is connected to the idea that despite the fact man is self-empowered during our lifetimes, most people feel insignificant when facing death. In “A River Runs Through It,” coming to grips with Paul’s death changes both Norman and their father. Norman and his father, a Presbyterian preacher, must surpass all of their religious and Biblical knowledge to understand the magnitude of Paul’s demise. In the film and novel, although they saw Paul in all his perfection in the river, Norman knew that “life was not a work of art and the moment could not last.” They both finally recognize that death comes to everything, throughout all

stages of life. According to Thomas, “We can forget about it much of the time, or think of it as an accident to be avoided, somehow. But it does make the process of dying seem more exceptional than it really is, and harder to engage in at the times when we must ourselves engage” (535).

All things affected by death are part of one thing: the earth, as Thomas stated. Life and death are contained within the earth’s atmosphere. All life comes from the earth, every living thing must die, and when it does, it goes back into the Earth. In “The World’s Biggest Membrane,” Thomas explains that earth was the first living thing that was produced, and points out that “it has the organized, self-contained look of a live creature, full of information, marvelously skilled in handling the sun” (536). Essentially, life does not come from an outside source. We see that God did not create the earth, nor did any such deity. The earth created itself through evolution, and threads of life are seen in all of its creatures, plants, and parts. Just as Virginia Woolf saw the hand of death in the moth, she described the insect as being “little or nothing of life. . . . as if someone had taken a tiny bead of pure life and decking it as lightly as possibly with down and feathers, had set it dancing and zig-zagging to show us the true nature of life” (344). In the same respect, death does not lead us to an outside location, such as Heaven. In “Death in the Open,” Thomas describes that when we die, “all that immense mass of flesh and bone will disappear by absorption into the earth, without recognition by the

transient survivors” (535). We see similar ideas in “A River Runs Through It,” when Norman returns to the Big Blackfoot River to remember and visit Paul after he dies. Of course, he was not physically in the river, but Norman says, “All existence seems to fade into my soul and memories,” and in his memory, Paul belongs in the river.

Because we are all part of a living, breathing earth, we can deduct that nature is not here for us, and has no purpose. Jeffries proposes that “there is no object, no end, no purpose, no design, and no plan; no anything, that is” (295). Humans are the first creatures to really develop a sense of self-consciousness. However, dolphins are supposed to be just as intelligent as humans, but they have not been inspired to built cities and create democracies. This is representative of Jeffries’ ideas that humans are selfish, while nature (including the dolphins) is selfless and we are imitators of nature. His ideas give indications as to why we have pulled ourselves so far from nature that we must examine it and contemplate our relationship to it. The fact that we are unsure of our place in this world may be a clue that we have done something wrong, and essentially, unnatural. Instead of living with nature, we have separated ourselves from it as far as we could, and created our own way of living. Culture and society are antithetical to nature. Nature is productive, plentiful, and sharing. Jeffries writes, “There is no enough in nature. It is one vast prodigality. It is a feast. There is no economy: it is all one immense

extravagance. It is all giving, giving, giving: no saving, no penury” (297). Humans have separated from nature, used it for our own benefit, and become the complete opposite: insatiably cheap and greedy. Jeffries also says that by giving nature a purpose, man is limiting it. He writes, “I look at the sunshine and feel that there is no contracted order: there is divine chaos, and, in it, limitless hope and possibilities” (297). Since nature has no plan and is not here for us, it becomes a creative work of art.

Rather than feeding off nature to gain spiritual enlightenment, many nature writers began to examine the possibility that nature is not here for our benefit, although we would like to think so. Relying on the knowledge that the earth has been alive much longer than humans have, we can recognize its evolution through many life cycles. Although the earth generates life, all of these life cycles are governed by death, an inescapable higher power. Although he is primarily associated with the Scientific Paradigm, one may draw similarities between Charles Darwin’s work and that of the writers discussed. His concept of “survival of the fittest” can be applied to the process of new life pushing the aged, decrepit life into death, which Thomas notes. Darwin’s Theory of Evolution also agrees with the idea that humans have developed a sense of self. If humans do not destroy the earth, it would be very likely that even more superb beings would evolve. However, man’s self-appointed attempt of a dictatorship over nature would never allow it. Despite man’s endeavors to control

nature, by understanding the patterns of nature and the earth's evolution, one can see that anything in this world is possible.

---

**Discussion Questions**

List three differences in language between this essay and the previous one from a Sociology class.

What do the differences tell you about the writing conventions in each discipline?

Why do you think social science majors are encouraged to present their work in a somewhat impersonal style and tone, while Humanities students are able to use the "I" persona to present material, and they are able to present impressions as evidence for their arguments?

Is one style more "convincing" than another, or is it that each style works persuasively within what each discipline accepts as knowledge and evidence for an argument?

---

A more typical assignment for social science majors is the literature review, a review of current thinking (published) on a particular topic, in which you indicate strengths and weaknesses. In the Humanities, this function is often served by the annotated bibliography, in which the same sort of inventory is conducted through the key research for a particular subject. One of the key differences, however, between the two is that a literature review is not a simple summary of research with a few notes to indicate strengths and weaknesses: the literature review must be shaped and directed by a guiding argument, usually the central argument of a longer research project, for which the literature review serves as a kind of introduction.

Note a number of features in this convention of writing in the social sciences: there is no "I" persona guiding the argument, and the

passive voice is used regularly in representing the material in the literature review. Emphasis is on reporting the research before commenting on weaknesses and strengths. The personality of the writer is revealed more subtly than might be the case in an informal essay you would write for Philosophy or English, usually in the discursive summary of the material, the distinctions that are drawn between various studies and researchers, and in the application of the results of the review to the writer's particular research topic. The following is a good example of a literature review, also provided by Professor Sue Hudd.

### **Educators & Child Maltreatment:**

## Preventing, Detecting, and Handling the Crisis

Christina Hood  
Dr. Sue Hudd  
Literature Review

SO 381  
26 April 2005

### **Preface**

Child abuse and neglect is a serious problem in our country. Research conducted in 1997 by child protective service agencies found that approximately 1 million children that year were victims of abuse or neglect; the actual numbers, however, are much higher because most of the abuse and neglect that takes place goes unreported (Sechrist, 2000). Formally, child abuse and neglect are two separate actions, yet both inflict tremendous harm on the child. Child abuse can be best defined as "any nonaccidental physical injury," (Gullatt, 1999: 25). It encompasses actions such as physical, sexual, and emotional abuse. Gullatt (1999) uses the term "commission" to describe child abuse because it is a result of acts that are *committed*. Child neglect, on the other hand, is best described as:

[a] condition in which a caretaker responsible for the child either deliberately or by extraordinary inattentiveness permits the child to experience avoidable suffering and/or fails to provide one or more of the ingredients generally deemed essential for developing a person's physical, intellectual and emotional capacities.

(Gullatt, 1999:25)

Neglect is passive; rather than committing harmful acts, the perpetrator *omits* beneficial acts. The phrase "child maltreatment" (Gullatt, 1999: 25) is often used as a generic term which encompasses both abuse and neglect. Therefore, since both abuse (which also includes sexual abuse) and neglect will both be referenced, the term "maltreatment" is apt.

Because it is difficult, and in many cases impossible, for children to protect themselves, they must rely on adults to step in and help them. As was aforementioned, over 1 million children are maltreated every year (Sechrist, 2000) and the actual number of maltreatment cases is much higher. Most of the cases are not accounted for because there is a great problem with lack of reporting. As a result, many cases of maltreatment go unnoticed, undetected, and unaided. A major reason, then, that the child maltreatment epidemic continues to persist is because most of the cases are not dealt with. No one can help a child who is being maltreated unless they *know* the child is being maltreated.

Because children spend a good portion of their waking day at school, the school seems like the most logical and efficient venue through which the problem can be attacked. Educators have so much interaction with, and influence on, their students that dealing with the delicate issues of maltreatment would be best handled in school. Educating is what educators do best, to state the obvious, and therefore it is more than rational that schools should make a priority out of preventing, detecting, and protecting children from maltreatment. The goal of shielding a child from permanent psychological and physical damage can be accomplished if teachers educate their students about maltreatment, can recognize a maltreatment case, and properly respond to and report a case. But the questions that stem from these

propositions are then: Are educators living up to this role? Do they teach children about maltreatment? Do they report maltreatment when they recognize it? Do they know *how* to recognize it? Do they know how to handle a child that has been maltreated? This paper will explore the aforementioned issues concerning educators—their role in the prevention, detection, and protection of maltreated children; and whether or not they are living up to their responsibilities.

### **Preventing Maltreatment**

Prevention programs are instructional sessions which aim to inhibit child maltreatment by teaching the children how to recognize abuse and protect themselves from it. Programs, when implemented, can range from one 2-hour session (presentational) all the way up to continuous instruction built into the daily curriculum (comprehensive). A question often raised by teachers, parents, and scholars is whether or not the prevention programs are effective; and, if so, what types of programs work best. As such, studies have been conducted which seek to determine the efficacy of various programs. For example, a landmark study managed by Finkelhor et al. (1995) used a stratified random sample to survey 2,000 youth, between the ages of 10 and 16, via a 30 minute to 1 hour phone conversation. After obtaining permission from the child's guardian, the surveyor asked what the child's school did to address maltreatment issues, what the parents did, tested the child's knowledge of maltreatment, asked about the child's personal encounters with maltreatment (if any), asked what the child did to protect themselves, and if they were confident that it helped. A major strength behind the legitimacy of the phone conversation is that the surveyors asked the questions twice in the span of the dialogue, so as to verify that the child was not making up responses. What the study found was that those children who had received some type of school-based instruction felt better able to protect themselves when faced with possible maltreatment. Furthermore, the study determined that the more comprehensive, meaning longer and more detailed, the instruction, the better the child was able to

prevent the maltreatment. However, the study also found that parental instruction, in conjunction with the school-based program, yielded the best self-protection results.

In another landmark study, Gibson and Leitenberg (2000) investigated the long-term effects of prevention programs. Surveying 825 female undergraduates, they found that sexual abuse prevention programs do, in fact, reduce the incidence of abuse. In addition, both studies were able to determine that prevention programs do not increase the likelihood of maltreatment—a concern that many hold on the grounds that just learning about it will increase the chance that it happens.

Because it is determined that prevention programs result in positive consequences, a major step in reducing child maltreatment would be to ensure that as many schools as possible participate in prevention programs that work—namely, comprehensive ones. Comprehensive programs, as was aforementioned, are much longer intervention programs; they are usually over 4 hours long. Dake et al. (2003), in a study of 3<sup>rd</sup> graders, determined that longer programs result in the greater likelihood that the child will use self-protection strategies and report incidences of maltreatment. To make the program easier to employ, Dake et al. (2003) suggests fusing maltreatment prevention programs with the health education program—resulting in a 9-month long program which follows the child through school.

Prevention programs, ultimately, should teach the child certain strategies for recognizing, handling, and reporting maltreatment. Common topics of discussion include “good touch/ bad touch,” defining abuse, making the child aware of their rights, and helping them designate a “safe” person to contact if something were to happen (Lanning et al., 1999). These discussions can be reinforced with videos, role playing, and even puppet shows (Lanning et al., 1999).

While there are many ways to teach children about maltreatment at school, and these programs have proven effective, the reality is that many schools do not implement prevention instruction in any form. Lanning et al. (1999) conducted a study which found that only 65% of the schools they surveyed addressed the issue of maltreatment at all. Those that did address maltreatment had little, if any,

funding, did not provide training for those giving the presentation, and had no method for evaluating the program within the school to ensure that it was working. They determined that most of the presentations were brief, and were not part of a curriculum. Lanning et al. (1999) concluded that while many schools lacked funding for a prevention program, the main reason that it was never implemented was out of laziness on the part of the administrators and teachers.

### **Detecting Maltreatment**

Although there are many things that educators can do to help prevent maltreatment from occurring, it is inevitable that there will still be cases of maltreatment among the students in the school. As such, it is necessary for educators to be able to recognize the signs of maltreatment—physical and emotional—so that further steps can be taken to thwart the continuation of the maltreatment.

It is imperative that educators be able to identify maltreatment. As an aid to all those who handle children, Dr. Adele Brodtkin has compiled a list of maltreatment warning signs: “(a) bruises, (b) lumps, (c) welts, (d) repeated broken bones, (e) bum[p]s of all sorts, (f) wariness around adults, (g) frequent school absences, (h) accident-proneness, (i) poor concentration, (o) academic failures, (k) increased aggression, (l) hanging around school before and after classes, and [being] (in) poor peer relationships” (Gullatt, 1999: 26). And while these signs can exist all year round, there are certain cases and times of the year in which the educator should be especially cognizant. For example, if the child’s parents are going through divorce or job loss, the educator should take special care in ensuring the child is okay. Report card time, in addition, is a time of the year when children are prone to maltreatment because bringing home a poor report card can result in guardians who are upset with their child’s progress (Romeo, 2000). Romeo (2000) suggests that educators take the time to discuss the report card with the child’s guardians first, so

as to placate them and ensure them that their child's grades can improve with time. This minor measure, for example, can prove to be a significant deterrent and important move the educator can make.

While the signs of maltreatment, however, may seem fairly obvious, the fact is that many educators are not able to recognize them. Kenny (2004) found in a survey given to educators that only 3% strongly agreed with the statement "Child Abuse is a serious problem in our society;" and 5.5% strongly agreed that "Child Abuse is a serious problem in my school." Only .5% strongly agreed that "I am aware of the signs of child neglect;" 1.5% strongly agreed that "I am aware of the signs of child sexual abuse;" and 1.0% strongly agreed that "I am aware of the signs of child physical abuse" (Kenny, 2004: 1315).

An earlier study done by Kenny (2001) tackled the issue of teacher's reporting maltreatment. The most common reason cited by educators for not reporting maltreatment was that they did not have the knowledge to recognize it, and therefore were not aware of it. The educators voiced that the topic of maltreatment was not covered in their education classes, they were not able to detect the signs of maltreatment, and they were not aware of the legal requirements in reporting (Kenny, 2001).

### **Handling Maltreatment**

If an educator *does* have the capacity to recognize child maltreatment, the hope is that they are then able to take the necessary steps to deal with the case appropriately. However, various studies have revealed that many educators do not know the proper actions to take, and those who *do know* often do not take them. States require, for example, that suspected maltreatment be reported. Also, schools usually have their own, more specific, policies on reporting. Many educators, however, have revealed that they are not aware of the state *or* school laws (Kenny, 2001). Kenny (2004) found that 3% of teachers were aware of their school's reporting procedures, 3% feel they would be supported by the administration if they were to file a report, and 43.5% strongly believe that teachers should not be required

*Minneapolis University Casebook*

to report abuse. Educators have also expressed reluctance to report because they are scared of being wrong, looking foolish, or not wanting to get involved in legal proceedings (Kenny, 2001). Some educators think that they can be sued by the family of the child (29.5% strongly agreed) if no maltreatment is found (Kenny, 2004).

The major problem with reporting is lack of knowledge on the part of the educator. Not only are most educators not aware of the legal mandate to report maltreatment, but they also admit that they would not file a report even if they were conscious of the regulation. There are many protections, however, for educators who file reports—and it is these protections that the majority of educators are not cognizant of. Immunity, for example, is provided for those who report maltreatment in “good faith” (Gullatt, 1999: 27). What this means is that no legal harm will come to an educator who has filed a report on honest grounds, even if it turns out to be erroneous. This protection was created to encourage educators to report maltreatment; however, it cannot promote reporting unless educators are aware of the safeguard. A report is merely an appeal for further exploration of the situation, and as such the educator need not feel they are incriminating someone (Gullatt, 1999).

If and when an educator does decide that a child is possibly being maltreated, or a child discloses the maltreatment, there are certain precautions and measures that must be taken so as not to damage the child emotionally. Too often, a child is bombarded with questions and finds themselves repeating their story about 15 times to: teachers, the principal, child protective services, police, psychiatrists, physicians, prosecutors, and even in court (Austin, 2000). This is very traumatizing and may lead to permanent psychological and social problems, not to mention the likelihood that the child’s story may change after having to repeat it 15 times. To prevent the trauma and ensure the story remains unaltered, Austin (2000) recommends the child is taken to Children’s Advocacy Center (CAC), where the

staff will videotape the child and know exactly what to have the child discuss on tape. If a CAC is not available, then taping the story is still highly urged.

Austin (2000: 3-5) also suggests some methods for properly reacting to the child:

remain calm and reassuring, take the child to a private place, position yourself at the child's eye level, listen intently, take the child seriously, obtain only the information necessary to make a report, do not put words in the child's mouth, do not use words that the child has not already used, allow the child to have feelings, reassure the child that the abuse is not his or her fault, begin with general, open-ended questions, refrain from using "why questions," do not condemn the abuser, assure the child that he or she is not alone, let the child know you are willing to help, do not touch the child without permission, tell the truth, inform the child of the process you must follow, thank the child for confiding in you, and help the child devise a safety plan.

These steps can help the child cope, stay calm, and endure fear or trauma, which is why every educator should be privy to this knowledge.

### **Analysis**

Because child maltreatment is such a grave humanitarian tragedy, our society should be doing all that it can to help mitigate the problem. We cannot expect children to become healthy, responsible, successful leaders of the country if they have led childhoods of pain, anguish, and torture. Every adult in society has a moral obligation to do all that they can to reduce the maltreatment crisis our nation is currently faced with. Educators in particular have a greater obligation to do their moral and legal duty to help children.

When a person becomes an educator, they commit themselves to helping children become the best persons they can. And this dedication does not apply solely to teaching the child reading, writing, and arithmetic. An educator should focus on the *whole* child—psychologically, physically, and socially. This is why the

issues surrounding child maltreatment are so applicable to the educational system; educators spend a lot of time with their students. Educators therefore have the potential to create a tremendous impact on the life of a maltreated child. They have the capacity to teach children how to protect themselves from maltreatment and recognize when it is happening to them. If the educators are able to recognize the signs of maltreatment themselves, and are aware of the proper methods of handling maltreatment cases, they can further protect the child from permanent damage.

The reality, however, is that these steps are not being taken. The majority of educators, as the facts have shown, do not have the knowledge or understanding of the issue or how to tackle it—and they know it. But, this lack of comprehension is not solely the fault of the educator. Educators do have a responsibility to learn about the issues surrounding maltreatment for the sake of the health and safety of their students. However, when teachers are not provided with the knowledge that child maltreatment is such a big problem, they will not take those extra steps to familiarize themselves with the issue. In other words, if the educators were *educated* about maltreatment, they would be able to play a greater role in the prevention, detection, and handling process. As is stands, the maltreatment crisis is costing the United States approximately \$94 billion dollars per year (Dake et al., 2003). This figure represents the amount of money spent on the immediate effects and long-term needs of maltreated children. To help mitigate the child maltreatment problem, directing funds toward the education of teachers on these issues would be more than appropriate. This proposal is preventative; that is, it suggests setting aside funds to teach educators how to alleviate the maltreatment emergency rather than waiting for the problem to deteriorate and dealing with the repercussions. Allowing child maltreatment to perpetuate is inhumane and everyone, especially educators, need to amplify their efforts to annihilate this human tragedy.

#### References

- Austin, J. S. 2000. "When a child discloses sexual abuse." *Childhood Education* 77(1):2.
- Dake, Joseph A., James H. Price and Judy Murnan. 2003. "Evaluation of a child abuse prevention curriculum for third-grade students: Assessment of knowledge and efficacy expectations." *The Journal of School Health* 73(2):76.
- Finkelhor, David, Nancy Asdigian and Jennifer Dziuba-Leatherman. 1995. "The effectiveness of victimization prevention instruction: An evaluation of children's responses to actual threats and assaults." *Child Abuse & Neglect* 19(2):141.
- Gibson, Laura E. and Harold Leitenberg. 2000. "Child sexual abuse prevention programs: Do they decrease the occurrence of child sexual abuse?" *Child Abuse & Neglect* 24(9):1115.
- Gullatt, David. 1999. "Collaborative efforts are required as schools address suspected child abuse." *Contemporary Education* [[H.W.Wilson](#) - EDUC] 71(1):24.
- Kenny, Maureen C. 2004. "Teachers' attitudes toward and knowledge of child maltreatment." *Child Abuse & Neglect* 28(12):1311-1319.
- Kenny, Maureen C. 2001. "Child Abuse Reporting: Teachers' perceived deterrents." *Child Abuse & Neglect* 25(1):81-92.
- Lanning, Beth, Danny J. Ballard and James Robinson III. 1999. "Child sexual abuse prevention programs in Texas public elementary schools." *The Journal of School Health* 69(1):3.
- Romeo, Felicia F. 2000. "Child abuse & report cards." *Education* 120(3):438.
- Sechrist, William. 2000. "Health educators and child maltreatment: A curious silence." *The Journal of School Health* 70(6):241.
-

---

**Discussion Questions: Making Connections**

---

Find three places in the literature review where the writer reveals herself, where the narrative moves from reporting to analyzing?

If the literature review is meant to introduce the research project that the writer intends to pursue, what can you say will be the focus of the research project that follows this review?

\*\*\*\*\*

When writing to learn assignments are linked with longer assignments, you can see how well the critical thinking/formal writing continuum works. The writing to learn assignments prepare the ground for the longer arguments and assignments by allowing the writer to prioritize the material into chunks of knowledge, insights and connections that could become the basis for a longer, sustained argument in a final paper. The result is a more thoughtful and persuasive final paper whose intellectual roots you can trace by examining the ground that produced it: the writing to learn assignments.

The following sequence of assignments comes from a course that Professor Sean Duffy taught in Ireland this past Spring semester, PO 311, Ethnic Conflict and Northern Ireland. Here are Professor Duffy's instructions for the shorter assignments: "*Prepare and post to the relevant discussion board on Blackboard one 150-200 word reaction to the reading: what is the most interesting or important new idea introduced in that reading and why? How can this idea be applied to the case of Northern Ireland? Remember, this is to be your thoughts and reflections – don't worry about 'getting it right;' rather, you should simply be doing your best to understand and apply the material you're reading.*" And here is a series of responses from student Kathy Grassi:

**My Post: Response to Owen, O'Dowd and Mitchell articles – April 18**

These three articles were really interesting to me mostly because of my novice in the details of the peace agreement stages of the Northern Ireland Conflict. I have worked extensively on understanding the emotions of polarization and helplessness of the individuals on either side of the divide. As far as understanding the logistics of the actual peace process and the actors involved, I have been very in the dark. So these articles provided me with a lot of background information I have been lacking. Although it was tough to get through the introduction of the Owen article, I did appreciate the information on other conflicts. As a history major, my awareness of current events (anything from the late 60's and on) is really lacking. One thing I found particularly interesting, all of these articles had a very positive spin on American foreign relations. The United States is playing the role of the diplomatic powerhouse, coming in to save conflicting nations. Owen even mentions it in his guidelines for ending conflicts, #6 is the inclusion of The United States being a great help in its presence. Is it just a bias of the authors of these particular articles? Or is the changing atmosphere of foreign policy due to a change in governmental control effecting how other nations read out intentions. Because I certainly do not get the vibe that our "commitment" to the Iraq situation is being looked upon as a "great help" by most other world nations.

In preparation for the reflective essay which followed the Blackboard work, students were instructed to *"select three of her/his own journal entries (from the discussion boards) and four entries from someone else in the seminar (all 4 don't have to be from the same other person). These should be the entries that seem most important to you at the end of the 3 weeks."* These Blackboard entries then needed to be reprinted as part of the reflective essay assignment: *"Your 5-6 page paper will then:*

- 1. Re-print the seven entries, properly attributed to their authors and the dates originally posted, and*
- 2. Include a four-page reflective analysis of the "journey of your understanding of ethnic conflict and Northern Ireland" that these seven entries represent. Be sure to reference the ideas contained in the seven entries, but don't make your 4-pg analysis a simple restatement of those ideas."*

Here are Kathy Grassi's Blackboard entries and the reflective essay that she wrote incorporating both the material from Blackboard and her own understanding of the material from the course:

## **BLACKBOARD ENTRIES [Kathy Grassi]**

### **Kevin Casey: Response to First Presentation – April 7**

A fundamental question that is raised at the end of the presentation is what are the governments of Ireland and Great Britain feelings towards Northern Ireland? In the sense that it was stated how some political groups and religious groups feel about the Northern Ireland and some groups feel that it should be part of Ireland and others part of the United Kingdom. However, does the government in power in Ireland feel that Northern Ireland should be part of the republic and that its rights as a sovereign nation are being trampled by Britain? Alternatively, does it not want Northern Ireland to be a part of its nation and has no issue with Britain retaining control. The same statements can be asked of Great Britain. Does Great Britain feel that Northern Ireland is worth retaining even with all the problems it has had in the past and could have in the future? On the other hand, would it rather not retain control over Northern Ireland and just has been unable to do so? Answering these questions would give me a better understanding of the conflict today and possible solutions that are available.

### **My Post: Response to Owen, O’Dowd and Mitchell articles – April 18**

These three articles were really interesting to me mostly because of my novice in the details of the peace agreement stages of the Northern Ireland Conflict. I have worked extensively on understanding the emotions of polarization and helplessness of the individuals on either side of the divide. As far as understanding the logistics of the actually peace process and the actors involved, I have been very in the dark. So these articles provided me with a lot of background information I have been lacking. Although it was tough to get through the introduction of the Owen article, I did appreciate the information on other conflicts. As a history major, my awareness of current events (anything from the late 60’s and on) is really lacking. One thing I found particularly interesting, all of these articles had a very positive spin on American foreign relations. The United States is playing the role of the diplomatic powerhouse, coming in to save conflicting nations. Owen even mentions it in his guidelines for ending conflicts, #6 is the inclusion of The United States being a great help in its presence. Is it just a bias of the authors of these particular articles? Or is the changing atmosphere of foreign policy due to a change in governmental control effecting how other nations read out intentions. Because I certainly do not get the vibe that our “commitment” to the Iraq situation is being looked upon as a “great help” by most other world nations.

**Kyle Sullivan: Response to Second Presentation – April 6**

One of the more interesting things I found in the second presentation was the lack of a central leader in the Catholic Civil Rights movement in Northern Ireland. When people think of the Civil Rights movement in American they immediately think of Martin Luther King Jr. in the same way Gandhi is associated with the removal of Britain in India. When I watched this presentation no one person rose to the top of the movement and provided a direction and leadership the movement needed.

The civil rights movement was based on the American Civil Rights movement which was for the most part a peaceful movement. A peaceful approach never seemed to be completely realized, and after Bloody Sunday all hopes of a peaceful resolution was forgotten.

If there was a central leader who inspired Catholics and could unite them then violence may have been avoided. None of the major parties had a strong leader who could be the face of the party.

**My Post: Response to the Reilly article – April 14**

The one point I found to be most striking while reading this article was the observation that democracy does not resolve conflict. I have never really taken the time to sit down and think about the problem solving structures of a democracy, but to say that it did not resolve conflict at all I found to be a troubling concept. Yet reflecting on the idea, it is an accurate analysis of the democratic structure. In our government, the party in power is continually changing, thus policy jumps back and forth depending on what side currently holds office (or majority in congress...or both). In the case of a "living" document, the Constitution provides for amendments to be made over time. These are both examples of compromise and accommodation, rather than permanent solution. That seems a bit unsettling to me, mostly because I would like to think that we are solving problems rather than pushing issues around. However, it does provide an arena for these issues to be raised, debated and discussed openly which is a much healthier situation than being suppressed or ignored (a major problem of non democratic societies). This relates to Northern Ireland because a suppression of ideas and opinions (Catholics being rejected an equal say in government) is exactly what acted as a contributing factor to the troubles.

**Maura Greehan: Response to Zartman and Lederach Articles – April 15**

I enjoyed reading these three articles and focusing on peace treaties, and conflict resolution. I enjoyed reading Lederach's articles the most because I was felt it really related to the other articles we have been reading this week.

It talked about how the peace process should not and can not be forced if it is to be successful. If nothing else, we have learned this week that the peace process in Northern Ireland can not be forced, both sides must show willingness to compromise if the peace agreements want to last more than a few years.

From this article I also learned that is important to understand that negotiations are not the first steps to peace, and a treaty is not the last step. Often society pushes negotiators to make rapid progress, basically to have something to show to the community. However, it is important to understand that there are many steps in a peace process, and not every one is as tangible as a signed treaty, but they are equally important.

**Chris O'Krongly: Response to Arthur, Cox and deVries/DePaor Articles – April 21**

These three articles all seemed to have one main focus. The focus was the fact that people living outside of another ethnic group or society have a completely different view and perspective of any conflict or situation. This is caused by the misinformation, exaggeration, and lack of communication. Reading these articles made me think back to the movie about the children and how their views of each other were so hateful simply because of some simple cultural differences. Many of the children had not ever talked to anyone from the "other side". But as they communicated more and learned the different perspectives, in a safe environment, free from criticisms of their peers, a more peaceful mindset was set. The L.I.V.E. program is working off of the same principles and should be quite successful in the development of an Ireland with better communication where more perspectives are seen and satisfied. I found it interesting when Cox's article said, "we were not even agreed on the nature of the problem, hence we could not begin to address the elements of a solution." I think this shows the major differences in opinion and the lack of communication that has existed. Peace will not be possible without the education of both sides to better develop communication and dialogue and to allow all perspectives to be seen and satisfied.

**My post: Response to McGarry / O'Leary article "Five Fallacies"- April 22**

The last article! This particular one focuses on the misconceptions of the Irish conflict from McGarry and O'Leary's point of view. It was interesting to hear their critique of the Northern Ireland conflict. Many of the fables they attacked were for good reason. After this course, I think that many of these misconceptions about the eruption of violence now seem silly and obvious. Although, if this was the first article that I had to read for the class, I might have found myself believing in many of the "liberal" perspectives that the two men attack. I do question some of their concepts. For instance, McGarry and O'Leary belittle the attempts to bring Catholic and Protestant communities together. I have more faith in human beings and their ability to understand and communicate than these men do. They contend the differences are not primordial, yet they still hold primordial views of the two populations being incapable of ever getting along. I find this to be a huge contradiction on their part. Such a stance also makes it almost impossible to ever hope to gaining peace in Northern Ireland. If there is no room for understanding and a sense of shared community, there is no hope for an attempt at peace. The idea is to bring two opposing sides onto the same page so that they can hold onto their individual identities, but also share in a common identity as residents of Northern Ireland. The Plessey vs. Ferguson stance of separate but equal communities is, to me, not enough. I believe Northern Ireland can move further than that, it will take time, but I have faith and hope in the fact that it can happen.

And now the reflection essay; notice how many of the ideas generated by the other members of the class found their way into Kathy's longer reflection. The basic idea of these linked assignments is that the writing to learn assignments, both those that the writer generates and those from classmates that the writer chose for this assignment, increase understanding and breadth of mastery of the material over a shorter span of time, thus producing the conditions for better formal writing.

### **Reflection Essay:**

Throughout the past three weeks, the course on Divided Societies and Identity Conflict: the case of Northern Ireland, has taken us through a series of articles, documentaries, films and discussions. The purpose of the course, though our personal objectives varied, was to gain an understanding about the complexity of ethnic conflict (with a special focus on Northern Ireland). Each night, readings were assigned on various articles. We

responded to the articles on an online database, contributing opinions and posing questions. It is through these journalized responses that our class has created a timeline of understanding. As the class progressed over the three week period, we gained an in-depth perspective on the complexities of internal conflict. The blackboard responses the class and I composed now serve as a map, outlining a journey of my understanding of ethnic conflict and Northern Ireland.

By looking back at the responses to the first blackboard presentation, there was an obvious sense of wonder amongst all of us when it came to understanding the current issues in Northern Ireland. Each individual came into this class with his or her own past knowledge and experience (limited or expansive as it may have been). We posed questions about the conflict and stated what we hoped to learn through our participation in this course. I found Kevin Casey's response to be particularly insightful. He inquired about Britain and The Republic of Ireland's aspirations for the future of Northern Ireland. At the beginning of this course, I would have assumed that Britain desired to invite Northern Ireland as a permanent member of the United Kingdom, mirroring the Unionist goals. Likewise, I was certain that the Republic of Ireland would share the Nationalist perspective and strive for a united Ireland.

As the course progressed, I was surprised to find that my assumptions were incorrect. I have now come to realize that the ambitions of Ireland and the Britain were altered by the outbreak of the troubles. Ireland feared that by inviting the six northern counties into the Republic, the problems of the north would boil over into the Republic's stable situation. In the same way, Britain was looking for a way to bow out of the conflict. Their inability to control the situation in the north was becoming an international embarrassment for the United Kingdom.

America's involvement in Northern Ireland was another interesting scope of foreign relations which was brought to my attention through this course. I found it interesting that unlike current opinions on American's foreign policy, the articles our class read for April 18<sup>th</sup> put a positive spin on US diplomatic relations. Owen, O'Dowd and Mitchell highlighted the importance of having neutral, yet powerful international bodies to bring about peaceful solutions to internal conflict. As stated in my post, I was surprised to see one of Owen's "guidelines for ending conflicts" was the active involvement of the United States. Through class discussion, I have come to appreciate the influence of America's economic weight. Our nation often throws money around in attempts to solve problems (not always

a bad tactic, it certainly worked well in ending the cold war by forcing the USSR into bankruptcy). I questioned why America's involvement in Northern Ireland was looked at in a positive light, while the Iraq war is seen as a step too far. I believe it has a lot to do with the fact that Northern Ireland was purely a diplomatic undertaking. The United States did not provide troops to end the conflict; instead we issued visas and sent men the likes of George Mitchell to aid in the peace process.

Shifting the focus from external to internal involvement, Kyle Sullivan brought up an interesting point about the leadership of the Catholic demonstrators during the Civil Rights Movement of the 1960s. In response to second PowerPoint presentation, Kyle commented that there was no central leader to inspire the Catholic population enough to unite them and avoid violence. His point is interesting because it highlights one of the issues that O'Leary covers in his article "The Limits to Coercive Consociationalism in Northern Ireland". In his article, O'Leary notes that one of the main failing points of power sharing in segregated societies is the lack of strong leadership. On page 116 of his article, O'Leary quotes French Revolutionary Ledru Rollin, stating, "As I am their leader, I shall follow them". It is O'Leary's way of demonstrating the situation in Northern Ireland, where individuals have a "willingness to put themselves in front of their crowd as opposed to leading them" (O'Leary, pg116). Kyle's blackboard response noted a leadership deficiency in the Catholic population. In reality, the Unionists had a more difficult time trying to find an individual with enough autonomy to make compromises at the peace table. Especially in the case of the UUP (the party has forced 5 of its leaders out of power since 1969). The Unionist's political leaders have historically been hindered by the strength of their "followers" and their uncompromising war cry "not one inch, never surrender" (O'Leary, pg117). This dynamic makes it very difficult to make any gains in the peace process, which is hinged on the ability to compromise.

Incidentally, compromise is the central focus of my response to Reilly's article "Democracy in Divided Societies". The article states, "Democracy itself operates as a system of managing and processing conflict, rather than resolving it" (Reilly, pg5). In other words, democracies do not "solve" problems, rather, they "temporarily accommodate" and "reformulate" to meet the changing needs of government. In my post, I connected Reilly's definition with my own understanding of the American Constitution as a "living" document, designed with the ability to amend over time. It is interesting to apply this understanding of democracy to the peace

process. I now understand that a peace agreement is not a “set in stone solution”, rather, it is a continual process of compromise and accommodation. The democratic system provides a political outlet to solve problems between communities. If established properly, each group has an opportunity to voice its concerns and work together in order to create a governmental structure where all parties can coexist peacefully. These theories on compromise and accommodation attribute to my new understanding for the modern day peace process.

Continuing with the idea of a modern peace process, Maura Greehan’s post for April 15<sup>th</sup> discusses the patience that is required to establish a lasting peace. After reading Zartman and Lederach’s Articles, Maura reflected on why a mutual agreement between two parties is required for a successful peace to be achieved. This is in reference to Zartman’s “ripe moment theory”. As a class, I believe that we were all able to appreciate the fact that it takes more than a single moment of opportunity to end a conflict. The idea of “cultivation” in Lederach’s article was a more acceptable concept. As Maura stated in her response, “negotiations are not the first step to peace, and a treaty is not the last step”. As cited by Maura, peace is created in a long, tiresome process of constant negotiation. That is hard for many to accept, since the peace is nothing tangible. We are no longer living in an age where Appomattox style agreements define the beginnings and endings of conflicts. I think the understanding of “modern conflicts” and an acceptance of the peace “processes” are some of the fundamental concepts that I have taken from this course.

Quite possibly, the most important aspect of the peace process is a foundation of understanding. In his blackboard post, Chris O’Krongly related this idea to the film that we have been watching in class, “Children in the Crossfire”. Initiating communication and getting a sense of different perspectives are essential steps in overcoming the stereotypes and misunderstanding that feed conflict situations. Chris points out that an important feature of communication is the ability to find a neutral, safe location, free of criticism from peers. He made a correlation between the film and the Glenree Peace and Reconciliation center. The L.I.V.E. program at Glenree strives to create a safe, neutral environment, similar to the one that the children in the film experienced by traveling to America. I have always believed that in order to reconcile differences there must be an open, honest relationship between individuals. There also has to be an earnest understanding of the alternate party’s perspective. The articles by Arthur,

Cox and deVries / DePaor have cemented these ideals about personal connections being fundamental to the creation of a lasting peace.

The final article assigned for this class tended to belittle the attempts of establishing personal connections between opposing sides in a conflict. As stated in my response to the article, "Five Fallacies", I totally disagree with such a negative perspective. McGarry and O'Leary's ideas of separating Northern Ireland into Plessey vs. Ferguson (separate but equal) communities is nothing more than a failed attempt at consociationalism and a lack of faith in the compassion of mankind. To believe that no common identity can be drafted between the residents of Northern Ireland is a theory I am not willing to accept. What I found most interesting about reading this particular article is that I did question much of the material. As stated in my post, this is important because prior to taking the course, I may have accepted many of these misconceptions. Through my questioning, I believe that I have demonstrated a better understanding of the nature of internal conflicts, particularly the one still present in Northern Ireland.

Looking back and reading the posts that we have accumulated over the three week span of this course, I think it is obvious that the entire class has gained an appreciation for the complexity of divided societies and identity conflict. The postings I have selected illustrate a progressive comprehension for the involvement of foreign powers, the internal struggle, communication and the eventual cultivation of peace. Through video documentaries, articles, class discussions and power point presentations I have gained insight on the issues and factors at work in Northern Ireland and thusly, a new appreciation for modern conflict in our world.

---

### **Discussion Questions: Making Connections**

---

What key ideas do you find running through the Blackboard entries that this writer chose in response to the assignment?

How are those key ideas linked together in the reflective essay?

How have these key ideas been expanded, embellished and deepened in the reflective essay?

---

## QU Writing In the Majors Contest Winners, 2006

---

During the past academic year, QUWAC (Quinnipiac University's Writing Across the Curriculum Committee) sponsored a writing in the majors contest which invited faculty from all departments in the undergraduate school to submit their students' best work. In the nominations that accompanied their students' work, we asked that faculty describe how the submission exemplifies good writing in the major. It was a great success: we received nearly forty submissions, all of them examples of powerful and persuasive writing, making the task of finding the recipients of the two \$250 prizes even harder for the judges. But we did find two winners, and we add their work to the WAC section of The University Casebook as further evidence of the good writing that occurs at Quinnipiac University.

The first winner is freshman Erin Cassella, who actually received two nominations for her work, one from Professor Richard Risinit, Economics, for a paper that Erin wrote in his Macroeconomics course, and the second from Professor Kathryn Drabinski, English, who nominated one of Erin's papers in English 102. Speaking of this particular assignment, Professor Drabinski noted in her nomination statement that *"students were asked to come up with their own topics based on a series of critical essays we read in class. Erin's topic, as you will see, was very creative, and she showed an impressive ability to move back and forth between formal textual interpretation and more informal autobiography. These rhetorical choices were made with argument in mind, and I was impressed by her ability to use the flexibility and beauty of language to formulate a complex argument that borrowed evidence from a variety of sources both inside and outside of the classroom. This sophistication is impressive in a freshman writer, and her creativity should be applauded. At the same time, her writing carries the charm of youthful exuberance, not shackled by the fantasy expectations many students carry with them about what 'smart writing' looks like."* Similarly, Professor Risinit noted that in his Macroeconomics course assignment, Erin did

*an excellent job with her assignment which pertained to the recent level of auto sales in the U.S. She displayed creativity in her approach to writing the paper by including some history of the U.S. auto industry.”* In both assignments, Erin was able to exemplify good writing within the conventions of two very different classes, at the same time as her creativity and research allowed her to do much more than slavishly follow a formula for writing a response to an assignment.

For the sake of space, we have not reprinted all of Erin’s English essay, only the first three paragraphs so that you can see some illustration of the qualities that Professor Dabrinski described in this young freshman writer’s work:

*And as the frog foretold, so it happened; and the Queen bore a daughter so beautiful that the King could not contain himself for joy and he ordained a feast. Not only did he bid to his relations, friends and acquaintances, but also the wise women, that they might be kind and favorable to the child. There were thirteen of them in his kingdom, but as he had only provided twelve golden plates for them to eat from, one of them had to be left out. (Grim et al. 96)*

“Once upon a time in a far off place there lived a little princess and her name was Erin.” Thus began many stories that I begged my dad for each night before passing into my own land of fairies and princesses. His stories were always short and on a level for a three year old but had messages that I would not understand until much later. Each story had a moral about sharing or loving your little sister, because after all, she’s the only one you’ve got. On occasion, I would ask to be retold one of my favorite fairytales. I would curl up beneath a little “Cinderella” blanket, my baby sister cuddled comfortably in my mother’s arms, and listen as my mom and dad would tell magical tales that I knew by heart. However, each time as they approached the end of the stories, my dad would take over the ending and proclaim: “And then Cinderella went to college, got a job, and was well-respected for her intelligence and integrity.” I would giggle at my dad’s horrible mistake. After all, how could such a famous man like Walt Disney have made such a multi-billion dollar mistake and consciously lived off of his erroneous empire?

*However, the feast was celebrated with all splendor; and as it drew to an end, the wise women stood forward to present to the child their wonderful gift: one bestowed*

*virtue, one beauty, a third riches, and so on, whatever there is in the world to wish for her. And when eleven of them had said their say, in came the uninvited thirteenth, burning to revenge herself, and without greeting or respect, she cried with a loud voice, "In the fifteenth year of her age the Princess shall prick herself with a spindle and shall fall down dead." And without speaking a word she turned away and left the hall. (Grimm et al. 96)*

Some of the most magical fairy tales happen in real life and are remembered through time in the form of the non-fiction essay. In her essay, Barbara Kingslover divulges to the world what she thinks that the ideal family is and should look like. Kingslover opens her essay, "Stone Soup" with an image of a young boy doing well in soccer with the support of his entire extended and "broken family" behind him. This term "broken" upsets Kingslover because she cannot find what breaks the happy group of people who all care deeply for their one young member. This happy scenario contrasts playfully with her later story of her childhood playthings, Paper Dolls, representative of the traditional nuclear family of "Dad, Mom, Sis, and Junior" in which she fondly recalls that, "I think you know what they look like, at least, before I loved them to death and their heads fell off" (Kingslover 753). This statement is overwhelming in its morbidity and is indicative of her displeasure with the traditional family. Through these examples, she is really explaining her own fantasy, her own fairytale family. Her dolls were her obedient toys with which she could create her own stories and themes, but they would not look like what she would eventually see in her own life, they were not perfect and she loved them too much. Later in her essay, Kingslover returns to her paper dolls and says: "If there is a *normal* for all humans, at all, I expect it looks like two or three Families of Dolls, connected variously by kinship and passion, shuffled like cards and strewn all over several shoeboxes," (Kingslover 757). These two images of the "happy *broken*" family and the "broken *happy*" family contrast to make the point of her essay, that people should do what works for them and not just follow what the rest of society is doing.

A deep examination of Kingslover's essay reveals a woman who is searching for the true definition of family. She finds that its impossible to define family historically as she analyzes its changing face through the century finding that "The Family of Dolls came along mid-century as a great American experiment" (Kingslover, 756). Thus, in Kingslover's opinion, the "traditional family" made up of paper "dollian" members is a new phenomenon that does not need to be taken at face value. Defining family

is a difficult task and is something that each person will have to find in her own life. Kingslover's main point is that it does not matter what a family looks like so long as there is love and support within the unit of joined people. Kingslover creates an interesting display of how the family is really supposed to be a meshing of a group trying to help each individual to find their way and their own identity.

For closure to her essay, Kingslover explains the meaning of her title, "Stone Soup." She recalls her favorite story from childhood by the same name and discovers that its discussion of the meshing of many foods to make a soup for a beggar who started with only rocks relates to her definition of the ideal family. At the same time that she discovers the glory of the meshed "Stone Soup" she finds a flaw in the ideals of fairytales such as "Cinderella." The two sentences that she dedicates to "Cinderella" are negative and cluttered with negatively connotative words, "Cinderella, look, who needs her? All those evil stepsisters? That story always seemed like too much cotton-picking fuss over clothes," (Kingslover 757). Her opinion of "Cinderella" as a definition of family does not work for her. For Kingslover, the traditional family does not include a fairytale marriage and the bickering of sisters. She has a wider definition of family, described as a, "a big empty pot, save for what gets thrown in it," (Kingslover 757). Kingslover's family is one that comes together over time, not by magic. [...].

Erin's second essay, from her Macroeconomics class, is a very different example of academic writing, although the alert reader will note several connected themes and images in both papers: the tension in this second paper is between reporting and arguing, and very likely the difference between these two cognitive activities marks the difference between exemplary papers in any major and average or less than satisfactory papers from the same class. Reporting means doing what the term suggests, recounting in some effective way details, facts, details you have gleaned from historical/reference sources. Argument requires (as Professor Christine Ross notes in her introduction to the freshman writing program earlier in *The University Casebook*—5-6) that a student move beyond the tidy categories and pronouncements that characterize most reporting to introduce a critical edge, a presentation that invites some response from the reader. Erin does this well in her paper:

*The Effects of Domestic and Foreign Auto Sales on the American Economy*

Erin L. Cassella  
Macro Economics 112-12  
Professor Risinit  
Term Paper, April 24, 2006

The American Dream is a well known notion throughout the United States and abroad. The idea of being the writer of one's own destiny is empowering to all young dreamers. At the start of the 20<sup>th</sup> century Henry Ford and William Durant were young dreamers who saw the world of automotives as the way of the future (GM Canada's Historical Timeline)(History). In 1903 Henry Ford began marketing the vehicles that he had been engineering and building for a number of years to an eager public (History). The Ford Motor Company began with meager investments and a few wishful investors but soon began to revolutionize production and time management (History). General Motors began in 1908 with the business smarts and know-how of William Durant who knew nothing about cars except that they were the way of the future (GM Canada's Historical Timeline). These two American car companies helped to pave the way for the century, changing the landscape with the need for roads for their cars and changing the ways of the economy, building a nation and globe dependent on natural fuels. Today, both of these American legends are suffering severe fiscal loses as the American automotive system loses steam to the foreign market.

As the automotive companies began to build steam, the purchasing public was not altogether intrigued by the new invention. The average working American could not afford a car and people tended to continue to transport themselves with horses and bicycles. As people began to recognize the ideas of Ford, Durant, and other pioneers of the automotive industry, the car became a necessary commodity in the homes of anyone who wanted to be a part of the forward-moving society. As Ford introduced the Model T, produced by the business genius of Henry who pushed for each car to be produced with lower and lower fixed costs by adapting production to the assembly line, the car became more affordable and every household could afford the new "Tin Lizzy" (History). As the vehicles became more and more reliable, they became a durable good. Durable goods are goods that have the possible life span of more than three years;

they are goods that consumers do not need to buy on any regular basis (McConnell et al. 75). Cars, like durable goods, can be put on the back of a consumer's purchasing priority list, when times get rough. This helped people to get through the Great Depression without having to give up the luxury of the new invention, but also without having to buy a new vehicle every year. The Great Depression wreaked havoc on both Ford Motor Company and General Motors, but each company made it through with a little hope and a lot of business know-how (GM Canada's Historical Timeline)(History).

As more and more people began buying cars, the automotives industry opened up a new sector of the economy in which more services would be needed specifically for this new mode of life. Auto-repair centers and filling stations for gasoline started popping up all over the nation. As these small businesses began to grow, people needed to have safe and smooth ways of accessing them and the government started pumping money into public works projects to build roads to get people moving through the country. This new ability to make people move connected the country like never before and people began traveling, creating more opportunity for new business such as hotels and other traveling amenities to begin to thrive. Glass and metal producers got richer as the demand for their products to build the cars began to rise. Thrifty businessmen all around the country began to recognize the great profit in selling the new cars and a new industry was born. The automotive industry changed the cosmetics of the American landscape, government policies in regards to safety, the environment, and interstate transport, but it had the greatest effect on the growing American economy.

The American economy was forever changed by the birth of the automotive industry and the new spending that it created through a process called the multiplier effect. Given all the new business that was created out of the needs of car owners and the auto industry itself, money was flowing through the economy as never before. Like the process of one great circulatory system, currency was creating vitality in the economic system like the blood in the body of an infant. As each dollar was spent or paid out by one of the businesses or consumers, there was more money going through the economy. The multiplier effect is a term used to describe the process by which a nation's overall GDP rises as a result of a change in spending (McConnell et al. 164). To calculate this overall change in GDP, one multiplies the initial change in spending in the economy by a number called the multiplier (McConnell et al. 164). By this process, the initial

spending in an economy can raise the real GDP nearly four-fold the value of the initial spending (McConnell et al. 165). A higher GDP indicates a healthy economy. This new automotive industry created an environment in which a healthy economy could be born and thrive.

Despite what these two American car producers did for the economy of the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, both Ford Motor Company and General Motors are currently experiencing some difficulties with revenue. In the April 4, 2006 edition The Wall Street Journal, the March 2006 earnings for automotives were announced in an article entitled “Sales for GM, Ford Drop Sharply as Asian Auto Makers Reap Gains” by Gina Chon. The article reports that American auto producers saw a 2.9% decline in sales between February and March 2006 while Asian producers experienced an average of a 5.6% increase in the same month (Chon A3). The article does not make any suggestions at what could have caused this difference in the sales for the two national producers.

Though the causes of the difference are unknown, there are several potential effects that this disparity can have on the economy. The Gross Domestic Product, or GDP, of a nation is the “the total market value of all final goods and services produced in a given year” (McConnell et al. 112). This means that the GDP is comprised of the final sale value of finished goods that are sold in a any particular year. Cars and other auto-motives would be included in this number, while things like the raw steel used to build the cars would not. The decline in American auto sales for the month of March could have an effect on the overall GDP for the fiscal year of 2006. This declining GDP could also be an indicator of a hurting work force and thus consumer base. As indicated in The Wall Street Journal Article sales to individual consumers were down 22% in the month of March, perhaps predictive of the fact that individual houses are not looking to purchase durable goods at this time (Chon A3). This lack of interest in durable goods could mean that people are trying to hold onto their money or are spending it on non-durable goods (those goods that must be purchased with regularity because of their short life expectancy, such as food) (McConnell et al. 75). If consumers are not spending money on durable goods it means that they are worried about some factor that is causing them to save and to be careful of making any major purchases at this time.

The interesting point made in the article is that the Asian automakers did see an increase in the month of March that the American makers did not (Chon A3). This could indicate that the American consumer is not fearful of the economy and is not saving money for a rainy day, but

rather purchasing the durable goods of foreign producers. This pattern will also have an effect on the overall GDP of the nation. American spending on foreign goods is not included in the GDP, and has the same effect on the GDP as Americans just not spending money on domestic goods (McConnell et al. 117). This spending of Americans on goods from nations other than the United States sends currency out of the United States and into other nations. This pulls on our economy and helps the foreign economy. The Chon article gives no indication as to what could have sparked the rise in sales for foreign cars, though it is presumably the popularity of the foreign makers such as Toyota, Honda, and Infiniti.

As the American car industry began over one hundred years ago, the American economy was forced to change, especially in one area, a reliance on foreign oil. Oil is vital to the mechanics of vehicles and today a vital part of the movement of everyday life. Currency leaves America every day in exchange for oil to keep cars and the economy moving, having the same effect on GDP as the foreign imported cars. As natural gas reserves become smaller and smaller and as pump prices rise higher and higher, all car producers are realizing that they need to progress farther into the future and build fuel-efficient vehicles. In March, Dodge (another American car producer) introduced its new Caliber model, a light weight fuel-efficient vehicle, to lots across the country, selling 6,500 units of this vehicle in its first month of retail (Chon A3). This is promising for American automakers who hope that the new technology will spark new revenue for their companies. While Asian producers seemed to have an edge over the two American producers last month, the American Dream lives on in the history of the two companies and in the minds of the futuristic engineers.

#### WORKS CITED

Chon, Gina. "Sales for GM, Ford Drop Sharply as Asian Auto Makers Reap Gains." The Wall Street Journal 4 Apr 2006: A3.

"GM Canada's Historical Timeline." Our Company- History. General Motors. 21 Apr. 2006  
<[http://www.gmcanada.com/inm/gmcanada/english/about/OverviewHist/hist\\_timeline.html](http://www.gmcanada.com/inm/gmcanada/english/about/OverviewHist/hist_timeline.html)>.

"History." Ford Motor Company. 2006. Ford Motor Company. 22 Apr. 2006  
<<http://www.ford.com/en/heritage/history/default.htm>>.

McConnell, Campbell R., and Stanley L. Brue. Economics: Principles, Problems, and Policies. 16th ed. Boston: McGraw-Hill/Irwin, 2005.

Our second contest winner, Matthew DiChiara, wrote his paper for an Anthropology course taught by Professor Alison Stratton. Professor Stratton notes many strong qualities in Matt's paper: his use of research material to frame the problem, his expert exploration of various elements of Tibetan Medicine which help illustrate the changes which are at the heart of Matt's paper, and his powerful "grasp of the principles for writing in anthropology." The reader should also note how this example of disciplinary writing is framed, most notably how it creates the room for Matt's argument by first presenting current understanding, a review of relevant literature, and only at the end, on page 66, in the "Discussion/Analysis" section of the paper, does Matt's argument come into focus. This architecture explains how one thinks in this particular discipline—anthropology, and accounts for how students are asked to write using different formats in different courses. Writing in the majors involves not only mastering the cognitive tasks that lie at the heart of a discipline but also mastering the written forms and conventions by which the products of that thinking are presented to a knowledgeable reader. Here is Matt's essay:

Matthew DiChiara, Final Research Assignment  
Anthropology 337  
Professor Stratton

12-15-05

### Tibetan Medicine

#### **Introduction**

Only through centuries of change caused by the Han Chinese has the Tibetan Medical system come to where it stands today. Tibetan Medicine today shares many practices with the Western biomedical approach; however, it did not begin as a scientifically based system that was

primarily concerned with the anatomy of the body, its physiological processes, and the reduction or elimination of symptoms. Instead, medical practitioners in Tibet had much in common with those in India who practiced Ayurveda and those in China who practiced Traditional Chinese Medicine. They focused on the connection between the mind and body, the spirit, and the emotional and mental factors that contributed to a state of health or disease. That, of course, was the focus of Tibetan Medical practitioners before they were subjected to the influences of the Han Chinese.

The end result of the Chinese introduction to Tibet is the progression of that medical system into one which incorporates many allopathic medical concepts and practices. This transition occurred over the course of a century of political conflict, immigration, military action, and social reform. This situation is of particular interest to anthropologists in that it provides insight into a clash of two cultures and the consequences of this interaction as shown in the respective medical systems. In this paper, the Tibetan Medical system will be explained; specifically, a brief history of how the system was formed, the medical theory, diagnosis and treatment, and how the Han Chinese have affected the way in which the Tibetans think about or practice medicine will be considered. Moreover, conclusions will be drawn as to what made this transition possible, and the implications and significance of the issue at hand will be discussed.

### **Literature Review**

#### **History of Tibetan Medicine**

Before examining the effect that the Han Chinese have had on the Tibetan medical system, it seems necessary to first explore the history of this complex and intricate practice. It is based on the teachings of Sakyamuni Buddha who lived approximately 2,500 years ago in Tibet (Steiner 2003: 86). As he aged, he witnessed the sufferings that occur in everyday life, particularly those associated with childbirth, aging, states of disease, and ultimately, death (Steiner 2003: 86). He sought to understand why such sufferings occurred, and consequently decided to go on a spiritual search (Steiner 2003:86). On his journey, he achieved enlightenment, which is marked by the absence of suffering and desire and the will to help all beings (Steiner 2003:86). The Buddha then used his knowledge to teach others (Steiner 2003:86). These teachings became the Four Tantras, which are the basis for Tibetan Medicine (Steiner 2003:86). They are classified as the Root, Explanatory, Instructional, and Subsequent Tantras (Steiner 2003:86). Traditional Tibetan medicine, meaning the system which was

developed in Tibet and practiced before any contact with the Chinese, actually integrated principles from Greek medicine, Traditional Chinese medicine, Ayurveda, and Mongolian and shamanistic practices (Graham 2003:4). As well as being a medical system which was formed on the basis of successful medical concepts and practices from other countries, Tibetan healing also developed from the philosophical religion that was native to Tibet.

### **Relevance/Importance of Tibetan Buddhism**

The healing art of Tibetans cannot be studied effectively without investigating Tibetan Buddhism. The Buddhist religion, like many others, teaches compassion and kindness towards others (Rinpoche 1999:2). A typical Buddhist seeks to understand and explain the nature and reason for the suffering we experience in our lives (Rinpoche 1999:2-3). They perform meditation and examine the nature of the mind in order to create positive states of mind and discover improved ways of living through better attitudes towards life (Rinpoche 1999:3). Tibetan Buddhists believe that there is no separation between the mind and body; they believe that the two act as one functional entity within each individual (Steiner 2003:85). Therefore, the body is incapable of being entirely healthy if the mind is not. Because the body cannot be healthy without a healthy mind, it becomes evident that Tibetan medicine could not exist without Tibetan Buddhism, as the latter of the two is a critical medium through which a person can improve the health of their mind. The two, much like the mind and body, are intertwined and dependent on one another for the success and integrity of the other. It seems necessary to also understand the concepts which generate the practices and healing methods of the Tibetan medical doctors.

### **Concepts and Theory in Tibetan Medicine**

The humors, elements, and the three poisons are the driving forces behind the ways in which Tibetan physicians diagnose and treat their patients. Tibetan Buddhism defines three things which are considered to be the long-term causes of disease (Rinpoche 1999:1). While they vary depending on the source, they generally seem to be listed as hatred, delusion, and desire (Bradley 1996:np). Both enlightenment and the many forms of meditation in Buddhism help to strip the mind of such negative attributes (Rinpoche 1999:2). When they have been removed from the mind, the individual is able to live in a more positive and unattached state (Rinpoche 1999:2).

Practitioners of Tibetan healing also consider what is referred to as the elements (Tokar 1998:np). There are five of these elements which

comprise the physical body; they are space, air, fire, water, and earth (Tokar 1998:np). These five elements then combine to create the three humors (Tokar 1998:np). The humors are wind, bile, and phlegm and are thought to control all the processes that occur in the human body (Tokar 1998:np). For instance, digestion, blood flow, metabolism, etc. are all regulated by the humors (Tokar 1998:np). Every individual has some of each element and each humor, however, the proportion can vary from one person to the next (Tokar 1998:np). In other words, person A may have more wind than person B, person B may have more bile, etc. Therefore, it is not important, according to Tibetan Medicine, to keep everyone at the same level of wind, bile, or phlegm. Instead, it is important to keep each of the humors in balance according to the requirements for that individual (Steiner 2003:95). When the humors are out of balance for an individual, an extensive diagnostic process is undertaken in an effort to return the individual back into a state of relative homeostasis.

#### **Diagnosis in Tibetan Medicine**

The diagnosis process in Traditional Tibetan Medicine is a three step process which consists of an interview, urine analysis, and pulse analysis (Tokar 1999:5). While the first step is literally considered to be the interview stage, this phase of the diagnostic process is when the physician uses listening and observation techniques to learn as much of the patient's current and past health issues as possible (Tokar 1999:6). The physician begins with questions pertaining to the patient's current state of health and psychological issues (Tokar 1999:6). These are followed up with more specific questions about his or her medical history, particularly in relation to the seasons, his or her dietary history, and the patient's thoughts on spirituality (Tokar 1999:6). More specifically, the physician focuses on the individual's physical appearance and the way in which they speak (Tokar 1999:6).

Following this exhaustive interview process, the Tibetan medical practitioner examines a urine sample from the patient (Tokar 1999:6). They consider odor, color and consistency of the urine, as well as the appearance, location and persistence of any deposits that may be present (Tokar 1999:6). The sample is then stirred with a stick after which the size, color, placement, amount and persistence of any present bubbles are recorded (Tokar 1999:6).

In the third and final diagnostic technique, the patient's pulse is taken, recorded, and evaluated (Tokar 1999:7). In Tibetan Medicine, there are thought to be 12 separate pulses, all of which are taken from the radial artery in each wrist (Tokar 1999:7). In each pulse measurement, the

physician records the width, depth, strength, speed relative to breathing rate and response to pressure (Tokar 1999:8). Once all the diagnostic information has been gathered, the doctor can then make a diagnosis (Tokar 1999:8). In order to confirm the accuracy of the diagnosis, the physician can examine the tongue, eye, and various pressure points on the body (Tokar 1999:9). With an accurate diagnosis, the physician begins a combination of treatments on the patient.

### **Treatment in Tibetan Medicine**

Treatment in Tibetan medicine encompasses the same aspects of health that the diagnostic process considers. Whether the patient is diagnosed as having physical, mental, emotional or spiritual health problems, the practitioner can choose from a variety of techniques which will direct the patient back towards health. Diet modification, such as avoiding certain foods or trying to eat others, is a common treatment technique (Tokar 1998:np). The patient may also be instructed to avoid certain behaviors or to take up certain ones, such as exercise or counseling (Tokar 1998:np). Many herbal concoctions and physical remedies such as acupuncture, moxabustion, cupping, massage, and inhalation therapy are also available to help the patient but they are mostly used to compound the main forms of treatment and usually not used as the treatment base (Tokar 1998:np).

The focus of Tibetan medical treatment is spiritual (Steiner 2003:102). The physician attempts to turn the patient's suffering into the drive to obtain enlightenment (Steiner 2003:102). This brings the patient back to Tibetan Buddhism which, as discussed earlier, is central to Tibetan medicine. The patient attempts to change their ways of thinking and remove hatred, anger and aggression, ignorance and incomprehension, and a materialist view of the world which are the root causes of suffering (Tokar 1998:np). The patient, however, is not the only one responsible for achieving good health. The physician may also assist their effort through spiritual exercises (Steiner 2003:103). For example, in the Mahayana tradition of Buddhism, a practitioner will meditate in an effort to reach *bodhicitta*, which is the "unconditional intention to help all sentient beings become free of suffering" (Steiner 2003:103). By reaching this state, he allows himself to "relate to the vastness and richness of the universe as a means to offer compassionate services" to the patient (Steiner 2003:103). Therefore, the patient is not alone in his or her search for optimum health; they receive help from the physician as well. Thus far, everything discussed about Tibetan medicine has been related to Traditional Tibetan medicine, a

practice which has changed since the introduction of an outside culture into Tibet.

**Description of the Change in Tibetan Medicine Because of the Chinese**

As time progressed and the political boundaries between Tibet and its neighbor China deteriorated, contact with the Han Chinese increasingly occurred, which resulted in a far different medical system in Tibet than the one traditionally practiced. Prior to engaging the Chinese, Tibet was a country with no centralized government (Janes 1995:12). Buddhism, through its compassion and kindness-driven lifestyle, helped to control the citizens of Tibet, and complementing this Buddhism-oriented culture was a highly pluralistic medical system (Janes 1995:12). It is one which relied upon monks, shamanistic practices and folk healers as some of the many forms of treatment. Its success depended highly upon the lineages of healers which were formed as masters taught their apprentices the knowledge which had been handed down from one generation to the next for hundreds of years (Janes 1995:12). However, interaction with the Chinese became increasingly inevitable and, as a result, the Tibetan medical system has been forever altered.

Due ultimately to Chinese influence, Tibetans now follow an institutionalized and professional medical system (Janes 1995:29). It has been stripped of the Tibetan Buddhist philosophies that, in earlier years, were so central to it in both concept and application (Janes 1995:29). Biomedical practices have been incorporated and training now focuses much more on institutional education than on the master-apprentice style which had depended so strongly on applied experience (Janes 1995:26). Although the change itself is clearly discernible, the way in which it occurred requires deeper analysis.

**Description of how that Change in Tibetan Medicine Occurred**

The destruction of the Traditional Tibetan medical system began in the early to mid 20<sup>th</sup> century (Janes 1995:13). As of 1911, Tibet was only partially independent, meaning major decisions were to be made by China but they did not militarily occupy nor control Tibetan land (Moh np). At this time the Chinese government decided to institute new training services and to increase physician numbers practicing Tibetan medicine (Janes 1995:13-14). In turn, these changes would have caused the reduced need for the apprenticeship style that had been previously used by Tibetan physicians. The Chinese also increased the building of medical schools which increased the utilization of the institutional training practices at the expense of the apprenticeships (Janes 1995:14). Damage of this culturally-

significant medical system had begun, and along with the mid 1900s, came increased efforts to transform it.

In the mid 20<sup>th</sup> century, the Chinese not only continued their efforts in modernizing Tibetan medicine, but they also used it to implement their socialist ideals while removing long held religious beliefs in Tibet (Janes 1995:15). New medical schools and hospitals were constructed which caused an interaction of Tibetan and allopathic medicines (Janes 1995:16). The Chinese began to use propaganda with the goals of destroying reputations of monks and lamas, exposing the feudal system as outdated and in need of change, and creating the desire for socialism within Tibetans (Janes 1995:17). With increased social reforms, so came a decrease in traditional Tibetan doctors (Janes 1995:17). As mentioned before, traditional Tibetan doctors used apprenticeships and lineages to teach; however, the destruction of feudalism and the forced introduction of socialism put an end to the lineage-oriented method of handing down knowledge (Janes 1995:17).

Moreover, the Chinese mainstream fiercely attacked Buddhist ideals (Janes 1995:17). They depopulated monasteries, sent home monks, and forbid monk-physicians from practicing medicine (Janes 1995:17). The death of a figurehead in Tibetan medicine, Khenrab Norbu, furthered the reduction of Buddhist principles in both their medical practices and their ways of life (Janes 1995:18). The replacement was more willing than Norbu to “de-emphasize...the use of religious concepts” and reduce the focus on the mind as the root of disease (Janes 1995:18). While the mid 1900s proved to be a devastating time for Traditional Tibetan Medicine, an international revolution was on its way eastward towards Tibet with no signs of stopping.

The Cultural Revolution that had begun in China and eventually spread throughout Tibet caused massive changes to the Tibetan medical practice and religious ideals. The Chinese wanted to remove all the old ideas, cultures, customs and habits that had been in practice up to that point which included Tibetan medicine and Buddhism (Janes 1995:19). Critical medical texts were destroyed while Tibetan physicians were sent to labor camps and prohibited from continuing practice (Janes 1995:19). China also instituted a new policy which stated that the Root Tantras could no longer be studied because of the religious implications and content within them (Janes 1995:19). The damaging effect of the Cultural Revolution was far more than the resiliency of Tibetan medicine could handle. According to Craig R. Janes, “By 1973 Tibetan Medicine as an institution had virtually

disappeared” (1995:20). Only with the help of local and county level health officers did Tibetan medicine make a small comeback (Janes 1995:20). However, this comeback took place in largely allopathic medical centers which meant “very basic elements of diagnosis and treatment, [and] emphasizing herbal medications, were incorporated into a practical, biomedically based public health curriculum” (Janes 1995:20). Only in the late 20<sup>th</sup> Century through today has the Chinese government realized and accepted the importance of Tibetan medicine.

### **Tibetan Medicine Today**

The recent and current state of Tibetan Medicine is much improved since the end of the Cultural Revolution. The government has established support for Tibetan medicine once again, both financially and politically (Janes 1995:21). They also employed emergency plans to re-establish success for Tibetan medical practitioners (Janes 1995:21-22). First, they gathered skilled teachers and salvaged any medical texts that were still around, and secondly, they tried to rapidly train and produce physicians to be put into health care institutions (Janes 1995:21). Additionally, factories for the sole purpose of producing Tibetan medicines were built, which helped to create demand (Janes 1995:22). Admittedly, credit should be given to the Chinese for recovering and rebuilding what was left of Tibetan medicine.

However, the phrase “too little too late” fairly describes the actions of the Chinese. At this point in time, Tibetan medicine has been altered from the traditional practice that began in the 9<sup>th</sup> century. It is one which operates in biomedical facilities and has, as a result, been forced to take on many of the diagnostic and treatment characteristics and techniques of allopathic medicine (Janes 1995:20). There is much less focus on Buddhist thought and practice which were so critical to the healing process prior to the 1900s (Janes 1995:32). Many of the lineages of knowledge also became obsolete as the feudal system died out (Janes 1995:17). As Craig R. Janes points out, “Once based on a didactic model of apprenticeship training, particularly in the context of learning diagnostic and treatment routines, training in Tibetan medicine has been standardized to conform to the model used for training biomedical and traditional Chinese medical specialists in China” (Janes 1995:25).

### **Discussion/Analysis**

Various conclusions can be drawn from what has been discussed throughout this paper. The most evident seems to be that the members of the Chinese mainstream culture who migrated to Tibet became too great in

number for those of the Tibetan culture to resist their influence. Due to numbers alone, the Tibetans were overwhelmed by a people who practiced, believed, and valued things other than those which they valued. As the number of Chinese in Tibet increased, the percentage of people in Tibet who desired to learn and practice Tibetan medicine decreased. Therefore, with reduced percentages of people who desired to keep this system of healing in use, its practice diminished. Tibetan medicine became more of a commodity or novelty than a functional and necessary medical system. However, as has been discussed, the Chinese have made relatively minimal attempts to revive traditional Tibetan medicine. The reasons that motivated the Chinese to take such actions should be, at the very least, examined. It seems that the Chinese government may be more interested in earning money than in the actual revival of Tibetan medicine. Tibet has become an increasingly popular tourist area and its storied medical system is just another medium through which the Chinese can generate further interest in Tibet and keep tourism high. This is particularly applicable to the last few decades, during which the alternative health industry has experienced extreme growth and success. With this constant clash of two medical systems and cultures, the Chinese continuously exhibit the same behavior.

In their interactions with Tibetans, the Chinese acted abusively in various ways. This social pattern likely occurred because the subculture which they encountered was outnumbered, less powerful, and in the minds of the Chinese, less culturally significant. They abused the Tibetan medical system, converted it to allopathic standards, took military and political control of their land, and probably only resurrected their medical system in an effort to generate more money for their homeland. Clearly, if any pattern is present, it is that the Chinese consistently took advantage of a medical system and those who had been practicing it. There is much more to be said about the many aspects of Tibetan culture, however, than the ways the medical system has changed.

Although the research considered only focused on the small aspect of Tibet that is the medical system, it reveals, through the eyes of a social researcher, much about other aspects of this controversial land. As far as the educational part of Tibetan culture, it has been established that Tibet is no longer allowed to practice many Buddhist teachings as well as many facets of its traditional medical teachings. Tibet, however, does not appear ready to entirely relinquish its Buddhist way of life and its medical system. This suggests that there is an ongoing struggle between Tibetans and the Chinese over which cultural and educational values are being taught. As a result,

children are raised in a society with two parts, both of which want their own cultural and educational values to be dominant. Children may feel a sense of having to pick and choose those values which they agree with and those that they disagree with. The effect of raising children in this environment has yet to be seen because this is a battle which continues today. A separation between the generations which were raised before the Chinese intervened in Tibet and those that have been raised during and since the Chinese influence seems like a high probability. By considering everything that has been learned about the Tibetan and Chinese situation, a theme reveals itself about interactions between two cultures.

#### **Conclusions/Reflection**

The entire situation concerning Tibet and China reveals its significance through the indication that a smaller subculture is at high risk of being absorbed by a larger, more dominant one. Smaller cultures may simply not have the ability to hold onto their own values when massive numbers of another larger culture enter their communities. These new members introduce new ways of life, values, beliefs, cultural norms, etc. that become so prominent that it is difficult for the subculture to avoid taking on these characteristics. The exception to this rule may occur when the smaller culture has an area that is dedicated to the sole practice of their lifestyle. An example is the Hmong of Minnesota, who, because they live so close in proximity to one another, seem to avoid the outside disturbances that the Tibetans were more susceptible to. It seems probable that pockets of uninterrupted traditional Tibetan culture, similar to the ones that the Hmong have maintained in Minnesota, could be found throughout Tibet, but because that was not the aim of this paper, none were found. The significance of the battles between Tibet and China proves interesting and relevant to anthropology through one major factor.

The situation between Tibet and China helps anthropologists to recognize when smaller cultures are at risk of being threatened by larger ones. They can study the circumstances prior to and during the Chinese invasion of Tibet and then look at cultures in similar threatening circumstances to determine if any type of a pattern develops or exists. If a pattern reveals itself, then anthropologists have increased their ability to predict when a culture may be at risk. That information can then be used to institute programs or practices to help preserve these threatened societies. After all, anthropology should be concerned with not only the study of societies and cultures but the successful preservation of them as well.

Although it is clear that the situation between Tibet and China exposes the susceptibility of cultural values and practices to more prominent practices, it also reveals that medical systems are vulnerable. Keeping in mind that the integrity of a medical system can be jeopardized by cultural change, it is reasonable to assume that other practices can be altered as well. There is no reason to believe that education, recreational activities, law and order, and religion would be able to avoid the consequences of cultural change. If that is true, then anthropologists, sociologists, historians and anyone else that is even remotely involved with cultural information are at risk of losing massive amounts of information when countries test their political boundaries as China has done.

As far as limitations and future directions, there are several main considerations. Only the medical aspect of Tibetan culture was specifically researched, and although it provides insight, clues and information that can be applied to the remainder of Tibetan culture, they cannot be confirmed without further research. Moreover, literature on the actual transition of Tibetan medicine was limited. One source contained an extensive, detailed description but it is only one source. A different author may describe the change differently and attribute it to different things. As for future research, anthropologists may want to concern themselves most strongly with the next couple generations in Tibetan medicine and culture. At that point, they may begin to see the separation between those who grew up before the Chinese intervention and those who are growing up now, which was mentioned as a possibility earlier. It also seems warranted to recommend investigating ways to maintain and enhance any connections that currently exist with traditional Tibetan medicine as that is the period during which the medical system was most closely intertwined with its people.

The project itself was one which I genuinely enjoyed. The freedom to choose nearly any topic, whether the class had covered it or not, provided numerous choices from which we could select one that we were interested in. I encountered no ethical problems or issues whatsoever during the research or writing phase of the project. Perhaps this would have been more likely had I conducted an experiment. It seems necessary to point out that, if anything, the project generated genuine interest in the Buddhist philosophy. I knew very little about Buddhism before doing the research for this project. However, because it was so closely related to Tibetan medicine, I inevitably learned more about it. Regardless of whether I agree with the Buddhist philosophy or not, I find it profoundly interesting and plan to learn more about it as it is a lifestyle that is far different than anything I

have ever known. Therefore, the project not only provided an opportunity to learn more about Tibet, which I find extremely intriguing, but it also created an interest within me to learn about something which is practiced throughout the world. I am thankful for this because it is fascinating to learn about others, especially in this increasingly diversified world.

#### References Cited

- Bradley, Tamdin Sither.  
1996 Introduction to Tibetan Medicine. Electronic Document.  
[http://www.tibet.com/Med\\_Astro/tibmed.html](http://www.tibet.com/Med_Astro/tibmed.html), accessed  
November 3.
- Graham, Lorie M.  
2003. Robert Thurman, PhD gifts from Tibetan medicine.  
*Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine* 9(1):84-93.
- Janes, Craig R.  
1995. The Transformations of Tibetan Medicine. *Medical  
Anthropology Quarterly* 9(1):6-39.
- Moh, T.T.  
A Short History of Tibet. Electronic Document.  
<http://omni.cc.purdue.edu/~wtv/tibet/history9.html>,  
accessed November 7.
- Rinpoche, Sogyal.  
1999. The Spiritual Heart of Tibetan Medicine: Its Contribution to  
the Modern World. *Alternative Therapies in Health and  
Medicine* 5(3):70-72.
- Steiner, Robert William Prasaad.  
2003 Cultural Perspectives on Traditional Tibetan Medicine. *In  
Medicine Across Cultures: History and Practice of  
Medicine in Non-Western cultures*. Helaine Selin, ed. Pp.  
85-113. Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Tokar, Eliot.  
1999. Seeing to the Distant Mountain: Diagnosis in Tibetan  
Medicine. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*  
5(2):50-58.
- Tokar, Eliot.  
1998 Tibetan Medicine. Electronic Document.  
<http://www.tibetanmedicine.com/index.html>, accessed  
November 3.